

**Appropriateness of
Minimum Nurse Staffing Ratios
in Nursing Homes**

Phase II Final Report

Winter 2001

Prepared by
Abt Associates Inc.
55 Wheeler Street
Cambridge, MA 02138

**Volume I of III
Chapters 1-5**

Table of Contents

Executive Summary	ES-1
1.0 Overview of the Phase II Report.....	1-1
2.0 The Relationship Between Nurse Staffing Levels and the Quality of Nursing Home Care.....	2-1
2.1 Introduction.....	2-1
2.2 Methods.....	2-2
2.2.1 Design	2-2
2.2.2 Sample.....	2-3
2.2.3 Quality Measures	2-4
2.2.4 Covariates	2-8
2.2.5 Staffing Measures	2-9
2.2.6 Analysis.....	2-9
2.3 Results.....	2-12
2.3.1 Staffing Levels.....	2-12
2.3.2 Total Wages.....	2-19
2.3.3 Nursing Assistant Retention and Turnover.....	2-19
2.4 Discussion.....	2-21
2.5 Conclusion	2-23
References	2-25
3.0 Minimum Nurse Aide Staffing Required to Implement Best Practice Care in Nursing Facilities	3-1
3.1 Purpose.....	3-1
3.2 Background	3-1
3.3 This study estimates the nurse aide staffing minimally necessary to provide a level of care consistent with Federal quality standards.....	3-3
3.4 Processes that define "good" care can be empirically translated into minimum labor requirements.....	3-3
3.5 Predictions of simulation models can be efficiently and scientifically validated ..	3-5
3.6 How the current report extends and improves estimates of minimum staffing to implement the five targeted care processes.....	3-6
3.7 Method	3-10
3.7.1 Identify residents in need of the five targeted care processes: MDS data analysis	3-10
3.7.2 Identify nursing facilities that vary in staffing requirements to implement the five care processes.....	3-14
3.7.3 Analytical Approach: Simulation Logic	3-18
3.7.4 Simulation Input Data	3-19
3.8 Results.....	3-23
3.9 Conclusions: Study Results.....	3-28
3.10 Future Directions.....	3-28
3.11 Conclusion: Setting Nursing Home Nurse Staffing Standards	3-30
3.11.1 Study Question: How Should Appropriateness Be Defined?.....	3-30

3.11.3 Is the OBRA Optimal Staffing Standard Attainable?	3-33
References.....	3-39
4.0 Nursing Staff Turnover and Retention in Nursing Homes	4-1
4.1 Introduction.....	4-1
4.1.1 Relationship between Nursing Workforce Shortage, Turnover/ Retention Problems, and Quality of Care	4-2
4.1.2 Purpose.....	4-3
4.2 Review of Selected Research on Nursing Staff Turnover and Retention in Nursing Homes.....	4-3
4.2.1 How Much Turnover and Retention is There?	4-3
4.2.2 Summary – How Much Turnover and Retention is There?	4-5
4.2.3 What are the Factors Contributing to Turnover?	4-5
4.2.4 Nursing Assistant Turnover	4-6
4.2.5 The Impact of Turnover on Nursing Home Quality.....	4-8
4.3 Quantitative Analyses of Turnover and Retention in Nursing Homes: Overview	4-11
4.4 Data Sources	4-13
4.5 Hypotheses	4-16
4.6 Results	4-18
4.6.1 Average Turnover and Staff Continuity.....	4-18
4.6.2 Distribution of Turnover and Staff Continuity.....	4-18
4.6.3 Distribution of Wages and Benefit Levels	4-33
4.6.4 Relationship Between Turnover and Wage and Benefit Levels: Descriptive analysis	4-34
4.6.5 Variation in Turnover Rates Within Cities.....	4-38
4.6.6 Regression Results	4-46
4.7 Conclusions	4-67
4.8 Policy Responses to Nursing Staff Shortages, Turnover and Retention Problems.....	4-70
4.8.1 Demographic Trends and National Policies.....	4-70
4.8.2 State Programs/Policies.....	4-71
4.8.3 Private Initiatives	4-72
4.8.4 Summary/Conclusions	4-73
References.....	4-75
5.0 What a Difference Management Makes! Nursing Staff Turnover Variation Within a Single Labor Market.....	5-1
5.1 Introduction.....	5-1
5.1.1 Existing Explanations for High Turnover	5-4
5.2 Methods: Selecting Geographic Areas and Facilities, Approaching Staff, and Conducting Observation, Documentation, and Interviews	5-5
5.2.1 Selection of Geographic Areas	5-6
5.2.2 Selection of Facilities.....	5-6
5.2.3 Actual Site Choices and Planning of Visits	5-7
5.2.4 Visits, Observation, and the Interview Process.....	5-8
5.2.5 Deliberate Variation in Turnover Patterns	5-10

5.3	Findings.....	5-11
5.3.1	Typical high vs. low turnover facility profiles.....	5-11
5.3.2	Five Key Positive Management Practices Associated with Low Turnover.....	5-14
5.3.3	Support for the Findings: Inferences from the Field Data	5-16
5.4	Valuing and Respecting Caregivers and Their Needs.....	5-27
5.4.1	Recognition	5-27
5.4.2	Scheduling.....	5-29
5.4.3	Respect vs. Contempt for Caregivers.....	5-32
5.4.4	Lives outside of work.....	5-33
5.4.5	The Workforce: The Vast Influence of the Immigrant Experience	5-34
5.4.6	Summary	5-36
5.5	Basic Positive Human Resource Policies: Wages, Benefits, Orientation, Training, Scheduling, etc	5-36
5.5.1	Compensation	5-36
5.5.2	Benefits and pay in lieu of benefits.....	5-38
5.5.3	Recruitment and Hiring.....	5-40
5.5.4	Orientation and Training.....	5-41
5.5.5	Career ladders and opportunities to advance	5-43
5.5.6	Why People Left Nursing Facilities.....	5-44
5.5.7	Summary	5-45
5.6	Motivational Work Organization and Care Practices	5-46
5.6.1	Consistent Assignment and Individualized Care	5-47
5.6.2	Quality of Care: Potential Implications of Individualized Care for Management Practices and Nursing Staff	5-49
5.6.3	Neighborhood concept	5-50
5.6.4	Meaningful and varied work	5-50
5.6.5	Dementia care: Adjusting to residents with dementia and caring for them.....	5-51
5.6.6	Involvement in Care Planning.....	5-53
5.6.7	Communication and Report	5-53
5.6.8	Teamwork – or its absence.....	5-54
5.6.9	What it used to be like: acuity, staff, regulation, etc.....	5-54
5.6.10	Attachment, Sadness, Death, Distance.....	5-54
5.6.11	Summary	5-55
5.7	Sufficient Staffing Ratios and Support for High Quality Care	5-55
5.7.1	Understaffing and Working “Short”	5-55
5.7.2	Building on Intrinsic Motivation.....	5-57
5.7.3	Corporate policies	5-57
5.7.4	Summary	5-58
5.8	Conclusion	5-59
	References	5-60
6.0	Case Studies of Nursing Facility Staffing Issues and Quality of Care	6-1
6.1	Background	6-1
6.2	Methods	6-1
6.2.1	Overview of Data Collection and Analysis.....	6-1
6.2.2	The Study Nurses	6-2

6.2.3	Nursing Facility Selection and Recruitment	6-3
6.2.4	Onsite Data Collection	6-4
6.2.5	Analysis.....	6-6
6.3	Findings.....	6-7
6.3.1	Staffing Levels	6-7
6.3.2	Allocation of Staff among Shifts and Units	6-9
6.3.3	Staff Absences.....	6-13
6.3.4	Agency	6-16
6.3.5	Extended Work Hours.....	6-17
6.3.6	Supervision	6-18
6.3.7	Nursing Skills, Expertise and Training	6-23
6.4	Conclusion	6-26
	References.....	6-30
7.0	Training and Education: What is Needed to Prepare Nursing Assistants	
	To Deliver Good Care.....	7-1
7.1	Introduction.....	7-1
7.1.1	Executive Summary	7-3
7.2	Methods.....	7-5
7.3	Nursing Assistant Profile	7-6
7.3.1	What Nursing Assistants Do on the Job.....	7-6
7.3.2	The Importance of Nursing Assistants to Residents	7-7
7.4	Who Nursing Assistants Are	7-11
7.4.1	Stayers and Leavers	7-12
7.4.2	Strivers and Endurers	7-13
7.5	The Link Between Education and Retention.....	7-14
7.5.1	The Importance of Turnover	7-14
7.5.2	The Effect of Nursing Assistant Education on Turnover.....	7-15
7.6	The History of Current Educational Requirements.....	7-17
7.6.1	1986 IOM Study and the History Behind OBRA 87	7-17
7.7	Effective Teaching Methods	7-21
7.7.1	How Nursing Assistants Learn Job Skills.....	7-21
7.7.2	Adult Learning Methods	7-25
7.8	Certification Education and Testing.....	7-26
7.8.1	What Gets Taught in Certification Classes	7-26
7.8.2	The Basic Curriculum	7-26
7.8.3	Going Beyond the Basics	7-27
7.8.4	Who Develops the Curriculum.....	7-28
7.8.5	How the Curriculum is Taught.....	7-28
7.8.6	Teacher Training and Supervision	7-29
7.8.7	Where Classes are Held	7-30
7.8.8	Certification Testing	7-31
7.8.9	Pass Rates.....	7-31
7.8.10	Who Gives and Evaluates Tests.....	7-32
7.8.11	“Testing out”	7-32
7.9	Transferring Learning to the Work Site	7-33
7.9.1	Orientation	7-33
7.9.2	Supervision	7-34

7.9.3	Organizational Support	7-37
7.10	Ongoing Education	7-38
7.10.1	What's Taught.....	7-38
7.10.2	Who Determines the Content.....	7-39
7.10.3	Connecting Ongoing Education to Experience on the Job.....	7-39
7.10.4	How Much In-service Education Nursing Assistants Get.....	7-40
7.11	Who Pays for Education and Testing.....	7-41
7.11.1	OBRA Mandates	7-41
7.11.2	The Cost of Initial Certification Education and Testing	7-41
7.11.3	The Cost to Nursing Facilities	7-42
7.11.4	The Cost to Nursing Assistants	7-42
7.11.5	Cost as a Barrier to Entry.....	7-43
7.11.6	Continuing Education and Career Advancement Opportunities	7-44
7.12	What's Often Missing in Preparing Nursing Assistants for the Job.....	7-45
7.12.1	Recruiting the Right People	7-46
7.12.2	What Keeps Candidates Out of Certification Classes.....	7-46
7.12.3	What's Missing from Certification Training and In-services	7-49
7.12.4	Orientation and Supervision.....	7-50
7.12.5	Problem Solving and Critical Thinking	7-50
7.12.6	Communicating with Residents and Families.....	7-51
7.12.7	Communicating with Supervisors	7-52
7.12.8	Managing Stress.....	7-52
7.12.9	Managing a Difficult Workload.....	7-53
7.12.10	Clinical Skills and the Nursing Process	7-54
7.12.11	Leadership Skills and Working with Peers	7-55
7.12.12	Cross-cultural Communication and Competence.....	7-56
7.12.13	Compassion.....	7-56
7.13	Career Advancement Linked to Specialized and/or In-depth Knowledge	7-57
7.13.1	How Career Ladders Work for Nursing Assistants.....	7-58
7.13.2	Who has Access to Career Ladder Programs	7-59
7.14	Examples from the Field	7-59
7.14.1	Site Visits	7-59
7.14.2	Description of programs visited.....	7-60
7.14.3	Nursing Facility Interviews.....	7-67
7.14.4	Interpretation of Findings.....	7-69
7.15	Innovations from States	7-71
7.15.1	State Initiatives to Support Nursing Assistant Education	7-71
7.15.2	Michigan	7-71
7.15.3	Massachusetts	7-72
7.16	Promising Practices from Providers and Other Non-governmental Entities.....	7-74
7.16.1	Dementia Care Training.....	7-74
7.16.2	Programs Offered by Individual Facilities or Chains.....	7-75
7.16.3	Programs Developed by Trade Unions, Associations, and Other Private Entities	7-82
7.17	Training Recommendations	7-91
	References.....	7-94

8.0 Adequacy of Nursing Workforce to Meet Higher Minimum Nurse Staffing Requirements	8-1
8.1 Introduction.....	8-1
8.2 Current Labor Market Conditions.....	8-2
8.2.1 Current Employment of RNs, LPNs, and Nurse Aides.....	8-2
8.2.2 Studies of Existence of Current Nursing Shortage.....	8-3
8.3 Factors Affecting Future Demand for Nursing Services.....	8-4
8.3.1 Population Changes.....	8-4
8.3.2 Impact of Minimum Staffing Requirement on Demand	8-6
8.3.3 Other Factors That May Affect Future Demand	8-9
8.4 Factors Influencing Supply of Nurses.....	8-9
8.4.1 Impact of Wage Rate Changes on Nursing Supply.....	8-10
8.4.2 Factors Affecting RN Workforce.....	8-11
8.4.3 Factors Affecting Nurse Aide Workforce	8-13
8.5 Initiatives and Strategies for Alleviating the Nursing Staff Shortage	8-15
8.6 Conclusions.....	8-16
References.....	8-18
9.0 Development of Improved Nurse Staffing Data Collection and Audit Tool	9-1
9.1 Background and Purpose	9-1
9.2 Development and Testing of the Nurse Staffing Data Collection Tool	9-2
9.2.1 Goal.....	9-2
9.2.2 Process	9-5
9.3 Field Testing of the Nurse Staffing Data Collection Tool	9-14
9.3.1 Facility Sample	9-15
9.3.2 Facility Recruitment.....	9-16
9.3.3 Consultant Recruitment.....	9-17
9.3.4 Field Testing	9-17
9.3.5 Findings.....	9-19
9.3.6 Conclusions and Recommendations	9-24
10.0 Current Medicare Payment for Nursing Care	10-1
10.1 Background	10-1
10.2 Data Sources	10-2
10.3 Methods.....	10-2
10.4 Results	10-13
10.5 Conclusions.....	10-15
11.0 Medicare and Medicaid Payments for Improved Nurse Staffing: Issues and Options.....	11-1
11.1 Overview and Approach	11-1
11.1.1 Overview	11-1
11.1.2 Approach.....	11-2
11.2 Paying Appropriately for Nursing Staff in the Context of Overall Rates	11-3
11.2.1 Medicare Rates.....	11-3
11.2.2 Medicaid Rates.....	11-8
11.3 Workforce Supply, Wage Rates, and Public Payment Costs	11-11
11.4 What Level of Staffing Should Be Built into "Appropriate" Public	

Payments?	11-12
11.5 Accountability.....	11-14
11.6 Conclusion	11-15

Appendices:

- A: Short-Stay Quality Measures
- B: State Initiatives on Wage Supplements for Medicaid and Other Public Funding
 National Survey on State Initiatives to Improve Paraprofessional Health Care Employment
- C-1: Nursing Staff Turnover – Interview Outline and Visit Process
- C-2: Nursing Staff Turnover – Chart of Interviewees
- D: Case Studies of Nursing Facility Staffing Issues and Quality of Care – Sampling Protocols,
 Case Study Protocols
- E-1: Nursing Assistant Training Interview Protocols
- E-2: Nursing Assistant Training Recommendations
- F-1: Nurse Staffing Data Collection Tool – Draft Tool and Instructions
- F-2: Nurse Staffing Data Collection Tool – Consultant Training Agenda and Instructions
- F-3: Nurse Staffing Data Collection Tool – Exit Interview
- F-4: Nurse Staffing Data Collection Tool – Revised Tool and Instructions
- G: Description of the RUG-III Classification System
- H: CMS Cost Analysis for Phase I